

Cellular Network Infrastructure - Feature #4044

regenerate vty reference during release process

06/04/2019 09:34 PM - laforge

Status: Stalled	Start date: 06/04/2019
Priority: Normal	Due date:
Assignee: osmith	% Done: 0%
Category:	
Target version:	
Spec Reference:	
Description now that the manuals are part of the respective program git repositories, we should somehow make sure that every time we tag a new release, the VTY reference XML is updated, ensuring [at least] the tagged versions have corresponding vty reference documentation. I know it may not be trivial to completely automatize it. So for now I think I would be happy if the release helper prints a reminder, possibly requiring a manual --override if the vty reference xml didn't change compared to the last release? I'm open for better ideas, but at the very least a simple reminder should be present.	
Related issues: Related to Cellular Network Infrastructure - Feature #3695: generate VTY refe... Rejected Related to libosmocore - Feature #4053: CTRL: Add CTRL cmd introspection to p... New 06/10/2019 Related to Cellular Network Infrastructure - Feature #4073: try to get counte... Stalled 06/21/2019	

History

#1 - 06/05/2019 07:36 AM - osmith

- Related to Feature #3695: generate VTY reference manuals from 'make' directly added

#2 - 06/05/2019 09:08 AM - pespin

I think it'd be best to add extra checks during VTY unit tests (like osmo-bsc/tests/vty_test_runner.py) to print "show online-help" and match it against reference.xml (osmo-bsc/doc/manuals/vty/bsc_vty_reference.xml).

This way we always make sure during gerrit time that xml file is updated accordingly.

#3 - 06/05/2019 09:20 AM - osmith

What is the advantage of that compared to always generating the vty reference when building the pdfs? If we did the latter, then we don't need to have the reference.xml changed in the patches, and we don't need to remember to update the file.

#4 - 06/05/2019 09:39 AM - laforge

What is the advantage of that compared to always generating the vty reference when building the pdfs?

I think it's really bad practise to require the execution of the program at build time. Think of cross-compilation situations, where certainly you do want to generate manuals, but you cannot [realistically, generically] execute the just-built program at build time as it's for the target architecture, not the architecture of your host.

#5 - 06/05/2019 09:41 AM - pespin

Hi [osmith](#), I think I don't understand your comment. Can you extend your idea?

I see several advantages about checking during gerrit verification (for programs that support vty_tests):

- Having documentation changes together in same commit than code change, also meaning people will take more care that VTY defined function will have all proper strings in place.
- Having master documentation always up-to-date
- Not having to do yet another step during release which basically is cleaning up mess from other people done previously

#6 - 06/05/2019 09:55 AM - osmith

pespin wrote:

Hi [osmith](#), I think I don't understand your comment. Can you extend your idea?

Sure. What I meant was getting rid of the vty_reference.xml file entirely, and only generating it at build time. This is also how I understood the proposal in [#3695](#).

I see several advantages about checking during gerrit verification (for programs that support vty_tests):

- Having documentation changes together in same commit than code change, also meaning people will take more care that VTY defined function will have all proper strings in place.

I get this point, if we did generate vty_reference.xml on demand only, nobody would look at how it changes during code review.

- Having master documentation always up-to-date

This would also be the case if we generate the vty_reference.xml on demand.

- Not having to do yet another step during release which basically is cleaning up mess from other people done previously

There would be no need for that either.

I think it's really bad practise to require the execution of the program at build time. Think of cross-compilation situations, where certainly you do want to generate manuals, but you cannot [realistically, generically] execute the just-built program at build time as it's for the target architecture, not the architecture of your host.

True, I did not think of the cross-compilation case. With that in mind, I guess doing it like Pau suggested would be the best way, ensuring that the xml file is always up-to-date with CI.

#7 - 06/10/2019 11:22 AM - pespin

- Related to Feature #4053: CTRL: Add CTRL cmd introspection to print documentation added

#8 - 06/27/2019 08:36 AM - osmith

I've thought about how one would implement the check in gerrit together with the regen_doc.sh scripts that [daniel](#) created. Here's what I came up with (not adding as checklist, because this is not assigned to me):

- remove git hashes from generated xml files (so they don't need to be adjusted after every unrelated patch update during review process)
- docker-playground.git: do git checkout for repositories from gerrit, not from git.osmocom.org (so we will have git commits present, that are in review state and not yet in master)
- docker-playground.git: scripts/regen_doc.sh: add VERIFY environment variable, and when it is set, verify if the xml files changed after regenerating them (exit with 1 on change)
- osmo-*.git: ./contrib/jenkins.sh: if WITH_MANUALS=1 is set, also run VERIFY=1 regen_doc.sh

[pespin](#): would you mind if I take this issue?

#9 - 06/27/2019 09:44 AM - pespin

- Assignee changed from pespin to osmith

[osmith](#) all yours, hearing that makes me really happy!

#10 - 06/28/2019 02:17 AM - laforge

Hi Oliver,

in the last phone meeting last week we discussed that @Hoernchen will look into an

approach to generate the vty + counter reference at compile time using inspection of the parsed C source code or intermediate representation based on clang. This approach would work at build time, even for cross-compilation cases.

Please don't do anything here without coordinating with Hoernchen.

#11 - 06/28/2019 07:39 AM - osmith

- *Related to Feature #4073: try to get counter and vty reference information at compile time added*

#12 - 06/28/2019 07:40 AM - osmith

Thanks for pointing that out, I was not part of that meeting.

#13 - 07/16/2019 01:52 PM - osmith

- *Status changed from New to Stalled*